PROCEEDINGS B

royalsocietypublishing.org/journal/rspb

Research



Cite this article: Jiangzuo Q, Werdelin L, Sanisidro O, Yang R, Fu J, Li S, Wang S, Deng T. 2023 Origin of adaptations to open environments and social behaviour in sabretoothed cats from the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **290**: 20230019. https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2023.0019

Received: 4 January 2023 Accepted: 20 March 2023

Subject Category:

Palaeobiology

Subject Areas: palaeontology, evolution, ecology

Keywords:

Machairodus, Amphimachairodus, linxia basin, Eastern Asia, competition

Authors for correspondence:

Qigao Jiangzuo e-mail: jiangzuo@ivpp.ac.cn Tao Deng e-mail: dengtao@ivpp.ac.cn

Electronic supplementary material is available online at https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare. c.6501234.

THE ROYAL SOCIETY

Origin of adaptations to open environments and social behaviour in sabretoothed cats from the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau

Qigao Jiangzuo^{1,2,3,4}, Lars Werdelin⁵, Oscar Sanisidro⁶, Rong Yang⁷, Jiao Fu^{2,3,8}, Shijie Li^{2,3,8}, Shiqi Wang^{2,3} and Tao Deng^{2,3}

¹Key Laboratory of Orogenic Belts and Crustal Evolution, School of Earth and Space Sciences, Peking University, 5 Yiheyuan Road, Beijing 100871, People's Republic of China

²Key Laboratory of Vertebrate Evolution and Human Origins of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100871, People's Republic of China

³CAS Center for Excellence in Life and Paleoenvironment, Beijing 100044, People's Republic of China ⁴Division of Paleontology, American Museum of Natural History, New York, NY 10024-5102, USA ⁵Department of Palaeobiology, Swedish Museum of Natural History, Box 50007, S-104 05 Stockholm, Sweden ⁶Departamento de Ciencias de la Vida, Universidad de Alcalá, GloCEE -Global Change Ecology and Evolution Research Group, Alcalá de Henares 28801, Spain

⁷Hezheng Paleozoological Museum, Hezheng 731200, People's Republic of China ⁸University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100049, People's Republic of China

(D) QJ, 0000-0003-4773-5349; SW, 0000-0001-7752-5620

The iconic sabretooth Homotherium is thought to have hunted cooperatively, but the origin of this behaviour and correlated morphological adaptations are largely unexplored. Here we report the most primitive species of Amphimachairodus (Amphimachairodus hezhengensis sp. nov.), a member of Machairodontini basal to Homotherium, from the Linxia Basin, northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau (9.8-8.7 Ma). The long snout, laterally oriented and posteriorly located orbit of Amphimachairodus suggest a better ability to observe the surrounding environment, rather than targeting single prey, pointing to an adaptation to the open environment or social behaviour. A pathological forepaw of Amphimachairodus provides direct evidence of partner care. Our analyses of trait evolutionary rates support that traits correlated with killing behaviour and open environment adaptation evolved prior to other traits, suggesting that changes in hunting behaviour may be the major evolutionary driver in the early evolution of the lineage. A. hezhengensis represents one of the most important transitions in the evolution of Machairodontini, leading to adaptation in open environments and contributing to their further dispersal and radiation worldwide. This rapid morphological change is likely to be correlated with increasingly arid environments caused by the rise of the Tibetan Plateau, and competition from abundant large carnivores in this area.

Highlights

The earliest *Amphimachairodus* discovered exhibits craniodental adaptation to open environment and social behaviour.

Adaptations to change in habitat and killing behaviour evolved prior to other traits.

Adaptatons to open environments and social behaviour first occurred near the Tibetan Plateau, probably due to aridification as the plateau was formed.

 \odot 2023 The Authors. Published by the Royal Society under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/, which permits unrestricted use, provided the original author and source are credited.

2

1. Introduction

The Plio-Pleistocene sabretoothed cat *Homotherium* represents a unique member of Felidae, with special hunting and social behaviours [1–6]. The origin of this behaviour and of correlated morphological traits remain largely unexplored, however, due to the paucity of well-preserved early representatives, and concomitant lack of targeted morphological studies.

The tribe Machairodontini, which Homotherium belongs to, can be traced back to the Miocene [7]. The Late Miocene represents the pinnacle of sabretoothed cat diversity [2,8,9]. The genus Amphimachairodus is the most widely distributed and successful genus among Late Miocene forms, and is known in Europe [10-12], western Asia [13], central Asia [14], eastern Asia [15-17], southeastern Asia [18,19] and North America [20-22]. This genus is mainly documented in the Turolian or deposits of equivalent age, with very abundant remains from the Linxia Basin (Yangjiashan Fauna and Qinpushan Fauna; 8-6 Ma [23]) and Baode in China (7.25-5.3 Ma [15,24]), and in the Quiburis Formation and Coffee Ranch in southwestern North America [25]. Many cranial traits of Amphimachairodus (e.g. the long snout and enlarged mastoid) are already Homotherium-like, suggesting potentially similar adaptations [7]. However, where Amphimachairodus originated and the function of these traits are still unclear.

In this study, we report a nearly complete cranium from Houshan locality, belonging to the Dashngou Fauna of the Linxia Basin (9.8–8.7 Ma), located on the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau [23,26] (figure 1). The cranium was listed in faunal list as *Machairodus palanderi* and *Amphimachairodus* sp. by previous authors but not formally reported or described [23,26]. The new cranium shows typical *Amphimachairodus* traits, representing the earliest member of the genus and providing a basis for investigating its peculiar morphology and adaptions.

2. Systematics

Order Carnivora Bowdich, 1821 Family Felidae Batsch, 1788 Subfamily Machairodontinae Gill, 1872 Tribe Machairodontini Gill, 1872 *Amphimachairodus* Kretzoi, 1929

Diagnosis: machairotont of large size. Rostrum long, and forehead wide. Orbit anterior border located at P4. Glenoid fossa overhung above basicranium. Mastoid process large, and paroccipital moderate to highly reduced. Mandibular flange weak or moderate, cornoid process small. Incisors large with serration, and upper I1 and I2 with laterally posited accessory cusps. P2 variably present. P3 with distinct anterior accessory cusp. P4 with distinct preparastyle and moderate to very small protocone. m1 with metaconid-talonid complex mostly absent.

Included species: Amphimachairodus giganteus (Wagner, 1848), Amphimachairodus horribilis (Schlosser, 1903), Amphimachairodus palanderi (Zdansky, 1924), Amphimachairodus coloradensis (Cook, 1922), Amphimachairodus alvarezi Ruiz-Ramoni et al. 2019 and Amphimachairodus hezhengensis sp. nov.

Amphimachairodus hezhengensis sp. nov. Machairodus palanderi p.257, Deng et al. 2013 Amphimachairodus sp. p.11 Jiangzuo et al. 2023 *Holotype*: HMV2041, a nearly complete cranium (figure 1; electronic supplementary material, figures S1 and S2).

Etymology: After the place (Hezheng Paleozoological Museum, Hezheng, China) where the specimen was found and is currently stored.

Type locality: Houshan, Linxia Basin, Gansu province of northern China.

Chronology and distribution: Thus far only known from the early Late Miocene of northern China.

Diagnosis: medium-sized *Amphimachairodus* with small incisors and I1 with lingually posited accessory cusps; long C-P3 diastema; presence of P2; relatively small cheek teeth; small P4 preparastyle and moderate protocone.

Differential diagnosis: differs from Machairodus and Nimravides in having different cranial morphology, e.g. lower angle between facial and neurocranial part, wide forehead, retracted orbit and long rostrum, shorter and dorsally arched zygomatic arch, slightly overhanging glenoid fossa, more arched incisor row and more separated lingual accessory cusps in I2, presence of P2, more distinct P4 preparastyle and smaller protocone; differs from Lokotunjailurus in having larger size, longer C-P3 diastema, stronger P3 anterior accessory cusp and more robust P4; differs from other species of Amphimachairodus in having smaller incisors, I1 with two closely located lingual accessory cusps, longer C-P3 diastema, smaller cheek teeth, smaller P4 preparastyle and slightly larger protocone.

(a) Description

See electronic supplementary material, appendix for detailed description and measurements.

3. Phylogenetic and biogeographic analyses

The Bayesian phylogenetic analyses with and without tipdating support that the new species is in a position intermediate between Machairodus and Turolian or equivalent-aged (herein 'Turolian') Amphimachairodus (figure 2; electronic supplementary material, figures S5 and S6). The Houshan cranium always forms the sister group of the lineage consisting of Turolian or equivalent-aged Amphimachairodus, Lokotunjailurus, Taowu, Adeilosmilus and Homotherina. The major differences lie in the different positions of Lokotunjailurus, which was sister to Homotheriina in ordinary bayes analysis (figure 5). The positions of metailurine felids are rather unstable in both two analyses and do not form monophyletic group in either analysis, but as our matrix mainly concerns the morphology of Machairodontini, the the position of metailurines in this study can be treated with circumspection.

Even though our analyses do not support that the Houshan cranium forms the sister group to a monophyletic *Amphimachairodus*, we do not erect a new genus for it as did Jiangzuo *et al.* [7] for *Adeilosmilus* and *Taowu*. This is because the Houshan material is close the Turolian *Amphimachairodus* in age and general morphology, and the potentially related genera *Lokotunjailurus* is only known from jaw fragmented and its ancestor form is largely unknown. The creation of a separate genus for the Houshan cranium is thus not justified and creates difficulty for assigning isolated material in the future. By contrast, *Adeilosmilus* clearly shows a craniodental morphology linking it to Homotherina, and



Figure 1. (a) Cranium of Amphimachairodus hezhengensis sp. nov. HMV2041. a1, dorsal view; a2, anterior view; a3, ventral view; a4, postero-ventral view; a5, lateral view. (b) Geography of fossil locality. (c) Pathology of the MC2 and MC3 of Amphimachairodus sp. HMV2047 forepaw. (d) Large predator contemporary with A. hezhengensis in the Linxia Basin. d1, A. hezhengensis, HMV2041; d2, Dinocrocuta gigantea, HMV2044; d3, Agriotheriini ursid, HMV2046.

Taowu is much younger and smaller, so the separation of these two genera is justified.

Our biogeographic analyses favour a BAYAREALIKE + J model, and imply that the lineage of A. hezhengensis and other more derived Machairodontini probably originated in Asia (figure 2). As seen in this figure, the diversification centre of Machairodontini changed several times in its evolutionary history. We further draw the diversification, dispersal and vicariance lines of this tribe, and find that the diversificaition and dispersal of this tribe increase dramatically after the appearance of A. hezhengensis. An adaptation to open environments (see below) and global aridification in the Late Miocene [27] contributed to its geographical expansion and diversification. Both diversification and vicariance reach their peaks in the latest Miocene, then reduce significantly following the great environmental change at the Miocene-Pliocene boundary [28-32], and only the African lineage (from Adeilosmilus to Homotheriina) survived. Subsequently, the dispersal of the tribe continues and reaches its peak in the Early Pliocene, resulting in a second increase in diversification. In the Pliocene, the Homotheriina evolved derived postcranial traits that are more adapted to open environments [33,34]. This adaptation increased the dispersal ability of Homotheriina, and weakens the vicariance effect, leading to the occurrence of widely distributed species (e.g. the pan-Eurasian *H. crenatidens* and *H. latidens*) but low diversity for the subtribe as a whole.

Evidence for adaptations to open environments and social behaviour in early Machairodontini

As in other species of *Amphimachairodus*, *A. hezhengensis* has a forehead that is much wider than the rostrum. A very wide forehead is seen in modern cheetah *Acinonyx jubatus* and snow leopard *Panthera uncia* and is correlated with an

3



Figure 2. Tip-dating phylogeny of Machairodontinae. Biogeographic hypotheses (BioGeoBEARS implemented in RASP 4.2) are located at the nodes, with pie charts indicating the posterior probabilities of that node being present in a given geograpical region. The dispersal curves (for Machairodontini only, from *M. aphanistus* to Homotheriina) are located at the bottom of the figure. See the posterior probability of each node of the tip-dating phylogenetic analysis in the electronic supplementary material, appendix. The reconstruction of *Homotherium serum* from data in digimorph (http://www.digimorph.org/index.phtml). The photo of *Machairodus aphanistus* from Batallones comes from https://fossilhuntress.blogspot.com/2016/10/, the others are by the authors.

enlarged frontal sinus [35]. The frontal sinus is connected with the nasal passages through small ostia and is normally in continual communication with the nasal air [36]. An expanded frontal sinus can serve as a thermal buffer for cold hair and heat dissipation during running, and help in respiration. Both *Ac. jubatus* and *P. uncia* live in open environments [37]. The wide forehead in *Amphimachairodus* is therefore likely to be an adaptation to open environments.

4



Figure 3. (*a*) Geometric morphometric analysis of cranial lateral profiles, showing the change in orbit position and length of the zygomatic arch along PC1. The arrow in the morphospace suggests similar patterns of difference between *Amphimachairodus–Machairodus* and *P. leo–P. tigris*. (*b*) Eyesight range and rostral length of some big cats, showing the different adaptations. (*c*) Boxplots of the angle between the long axis of orbit and the sagittal plane (in ventral view), showing the relationship between angle and focal ability.

Such a wide forehead is absent in *Nimravides* and *Machairodus* [11,20,38]. Notably, *Homotherium* also has a wide forehead, whereas *Xenosmilus*, which has less cursorial postcranial bones and lived in forest, has a narrower forehead [39].

The GM analysis (lateral view) also suggests that *A. hezhengensis* is located close to other species of *Amphimachairodus*, but is distinct from *Machairodus*. The major differences are in the first PC, which mainly explains differences in the length of the rostrum of the cranium and zygomatic length (figure 3*a*). It is interesting to note that the derived traits exhibited in *A. hezhengensis* are mainly cranial traits that are correlated with specialized hunting behaviour. The short zygomatic arch and large mastoid process suggest that masticatory strength is weakened, whereas

the neck muscles tend to become better developed [3,40,41]. This suggests that the hunting behaviour of *A. hezhengensis* is closer to younger *Amphimachairodus* and *Homotherium*, in using a bite mainly effectuated by neck muscles to quickly kill the prey, and different from that of *Machairodus*, whose killing behaviour is probably effectuated mainly by the temporal and masseter muscles, like those of living big cats.

The long rostrum can lead to an increase in gape. The less angled facial and neurocranial parts, retracted orbit (in the middle of the cranium), and long rostrum are reminiscent of the modern lion *Panthera leo*. This morphology may be related to a wider field of view but a weaker ability to target a single point. We calculated the angle between the long axis of the orbit and the sagittal plane (in dorsal view; 5



Figure 4. Evolutionary rates of traits of different blocks. (a) Boxplots of rates among the three blocks and (b) rates of different blocks of each branch.

figure 3b for details). Even though there is overlap, the lion Pa. leo has a significantly smaller angle compared with other species of Panthera, which otherwise have similar angles, except Pa. uncia with a very large angle (figure 3c). A small angle suggests a laterally oriented orbit. In Felini, Puma has a similar angle to that of most species of Panthera, whereas Acinonyx is close to Pa. uncia. Machairodus and Nimravides have large angles, similar to Pa. uncia and Acinonyx, whereas Amphimachairodus and Homotherium have similar values to Pa. leo. Of this feature, A. hezhengensis is within the range of variation of A. horribilis, which has a similarly laterally oriented orbit. In open environments, prey are more conspicuous, and thus precise targeting by stereo vision becomes less necessary in general, but Acinonyx is able to run swiftly when chasing prey, and P. uncia needs to target caprine prey in rock cover. Both species require stereo vision. A laterally oriented and posteriorly located orbit on the side of the cranium allows for a wider field of view (figure 3b), and assists in prey identification, as well as targeting other companions during cooperative hunting, a trait more correlated with social behaviour. This adaptation is well developed in lions as compared to other pantherine cats and is developed to a still greater degree in Amphimachairodus. The situation in Machairodus is more similar to that of the tiger (figure 3a,c). Such contrasts suggest similar differences in adaptation between Amphimachairodus and Machairodus, just like lion and tiger.

Our ancestral state reconstruction (electronic supplementary material, figure S9) supports that this unique cranial trait first evolved in *A. hezhengensis* and remains unchanged in more derived Machairodontini. The difference in angle between *Amphimachairodus* and that of the cheetah suggests that the hunting behaviour of *Amphimachairodus* is closer to *Pa. leo* than to *Ac. jubatus*.

Our analyses of the evolutionary rate of traits support that the traits correlated with open environment, as well as those correlated with killing behaviour (see detailed set in Material and Methods section), exhibit the highest rates in the branch between M. aphanistus and A. hezhengensis (figure 4). This suggests that the evolution from Machairodus to Amphimachairodus that occurred in the Linxia Basin represents the most significant adaptative transition in Machairodontini evolution. The general traits exhibit the highest rate from A. hezhengensis to more derived Machairodontini, and many of these involve cheek teeth. The cheek teeth of A. hezhengensis are small and less derived, suggesting that the cutting efficiency of A. hezhengensis is weaker than that of the Turolian or equivalent-aged species of Amphimachairodus. The increased cheek tooth size from A. hezhengensis to the derived species of Amphimachairodus reflects enhanced cutting efficiency for shortening foraging time, possibly in the face of increased diversity of scavengers, including hyaenids, at that time.

6

royalsocietypublishing.org/journal/rspb

Proc. R.

Soc. B 290: 20230019

A pathological forepaw (figure 1*c*) is also known from the Linxia Basin (unclear locality). The forepaw is intact, with carpals, MC2-5, and corresponding phalange preserved. The size (MC3 length 101.86 mm) is similar to a small tiger or lion (101.01–124.00 mm, n = 17) and is similar in morphology. The middle phalanges are asymmetric to accommodate the claws. The claw is very large, and shows a gradually smaller size from the second claw to the fifth claw. This morphology fits with *Amphimachairodus*. The MC3 and MC4 became fused during the healing, which greatly restricted their normal function for prey capture and is likely to reduce down the running speed of the individual. Such an injury would severely influence the hunting success of the animal, yet the remodelled porous surface in MC3 and MC4 indicates the development of a chronic condition during

7



Figure 5. Composition analysis of the Linxia Basin fauna and contemporary faunae. (*a*) Proportion of open-adapted species in fauna from MN9-11 of Eurasia shown on the map, with the size of circle representing the proportion value (larger circle means more open species). (*b*) Proportion of open-adapted species in the faunas from MN9-11 of Eurasia. (*c*) Non-metric MDS analysis of faunal composition (family level diversity) of the Dashengou Fauna and faunae from western Eurasia.

healing, suggesting that the individual continued to survive after injury for quite a long time. The healed fractures support the existence of partner care, pointing to social behaviour in *Amphimachairodus*.

5. The origin of *Amphimachairodus* from the northeastern border of the Tibetan plateau

The discovery from the middle Bahean (equivalent to MN10 of Europe) makes *A. hezhengensis* the earliest known definite *Amphimachairodus*. In Europe, a very large collection of *M. aphanistus* is found in Batallones 1 and 3, Spain, both MN10 [11,38]. *A. hezhengensis* is distinctly more derived than *M. aphanistus* from these Spanish sites. This is in agreement with our biogeographic analyses, implying *Amphimachairodus* originated on the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau.

As seen in the analyses above, the cranial morphology of Amphimachairodus shows adaptations to open environments and cooperative hunting. This coincides with the paleoenvironmental evidence. The significant rise of the northern Tibetan Plateau in the Middle and Late Miocene [42] has a huge impact on the ecosystem of the Linxia Basin, which experienced a significant faunal restructuring at the Middle/Late Miocene boundary, and almost none of the Middle Miocene genera continue into the Late Miocene, and nearly all mammals from the Guonigou Fauna are new immigrants [43]. These new immigrants are represented by large high-crowned elasmotherines and hipparionine horses, both pointing to an open and dry environment. This environment continues to the Dashengou fauna, and hipparionines in this fauna also show more cursorial adaptations than contemporary hipparionines in Europe [44]. By contrast, there is no significant faunal change at the Middle/Late Miocene boundary in Europe, and many Middle Miocene genera continue into the early Vallesian [45].

To further test this hypothesis, we compiled the faunal list of the three faunas—Guonigou, Dashengou and Yangjiashan—with ages equivalent to MN9, MN10 and MN11 of Europe. We also selected 23 western Eurasian faunas from MN9-MN11 with abundant remains. These were downloaded from the NOW database [46] with amendments from the literature (see electronic supplementary material, appendix for details). We identify each species to open or closed environment, judging from dental morphology and previously published microwear for herbivores [47-49], and craniodental traits of carnivores (see electronic supplementary material, appendix for details). We found a high proportion of species with open environment adaptations in the earliest Late Miocene in the Linxia Basin and these environments persisted in the basin (figure 4). By contrast, western Eurasia shows a gradual increase in aridification since MN9 and shows geographical heterogeneity as previous research has suggested [50,51]. The overall faunal composition (at the family level) of the Dashengou Fauna is similar to MN11 faunas of western Eurasia as revealed by a non-metric MDS analysis, supporting the early aridification of the Linxia Basin. In the more eastern part of China in the lower Bahe Formation, the faunal is still dominant by forest species, e.g. viverrid, suid, cervid and low-crowned bovid [52], suggesting that at the beginning of the late Miocene, the arid area is still restricted to Tibetan Plateau at this time.

The early arid environment in the Linxia Basin, probably due to the uplift of the Tibetan Plateau to a significant height at this time [53,54], provides an environmental trigger for the appearance of open-environmental adaptions among mammals. Open environments also benefit social behaviour [55,56], due to the increasing visibility of carnivores to each other, and also of preys, which makes them more difficult to catch. When such arid environments spread at the MN11, *Amphimachairodus* followed.

Another factor that pushed the rapid morphological evolution and social behaviour of *Amphimachairodus* is the presence of abundant large Carnivora on the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau. These are especially represented by the huge bone-cracking percrocutid hyaena *Dinocrocuta gigantea* [57]. This hyena is by far the most common species of Carnivora in the Dashengou Fauna and



Figure 6. Reconstruction of two *Amphimachairodus hezhengensis* defending their prey (*Hezhengia bohlini*) from two *Dinocrocuta gigantea*. Artwork by Oscar Sanisidro.

reaches a body mass estimate of approximately 380 kg based on dental size [58], though the known postcranial bones [59], and an unpublished skeleton from the Linxia Basin suggests it is not that large, but similar to Amphimachairodus in size (see a life reconstruction in figure 6). Two unpublished agriotherine bears (size of Indarctos atticus) are also present in this fauna. Such abundant large predators not only compete with machairodonts, but also bring direct threats to their lives, as large carnivore tends to kill the cubs or juveniles, or single individual of other carnivores, just as modern spotted hyena and lion [60]. The open environment increases such competition and threats due to limited cover and high visibility. In Europe, Machairodus of the Vallesian often coexisted with Indarctos and amphicyonids with similar body size to that of Machairodus [61-64], and these species are often less abundant than Machairodus [11], but in the Dashengou Fauna of the Linxia Basin, Dinocrocuta is much more abundant than Amphimachairodus [26]. The defense for territory and life from other carnivores is an important trigger of social behaviour in Carnivora [65]. The Quaternary hyaenids Pachycrocuta is known as prey kleptoparasite of sabretoothed cats [66]. This is probably also the case in the Linxia Basin for Dinocrocuta and Amphimachairodus, and the two large agriotherine bears probably also have a bone-cracking diet and involve in such behaviour. The abundant large predators/scavengers on the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau may have created significant pressure on the early evolution of Machairodontini (figure 6).

6. Material and methods

(a) Institutional abbreviations

AMNH FM fossil mammal collection of the American Museum of Natural History, New York, USA

AMNH F:AM Frick collection (fossil mammals), Division of Paleontology, AMNH, New York, USA

HM(V) Hezheng Paleozoological Museum, Hezheng, China

IVPP Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China

UCMP University of California Museum of Paleontology, Berkeley, USA **YLSNHM** Yingliang Stone Natural History Museum, Quanzhou, China

(b) Other abbreviations

BI Bayes inference
H height
L length
M/m upper/lower molar
MN units of the Neogene land mammals of Europe
MP maximum parsimony
P/p upper/lower premolar
OTU operational taxonomic units

(c) Fossils and methods

The material of the new taxon described in this study is housed at the Hezheng Paleozoological Museum, Hezheng, China. Material of *Machairodus* at the AMNH, material of *Amphimachairodus* at the AMNH, HM, IVPP, UCMP, YLSNHM, and material of *Homotherium* from AMNH, IVPP and HM, were examined for systematic study.

Terminology of skull anatomy follows Qiu *et al.* [67], with minor modifications. The measurements follow Jiangzuo & Liu [68] with modification, and are shown here in electronic supplementary material, figure S1. Parts of the figure plots were made in the software package ggplot2 [69] in R [70].

Bayesian inference using MrBayes 3.2.7 [71,72] was employed in the phylogenetic analyses. We performed both a non-dating method and a tip-dating method with a relaxed clock model [73]. In practice, Smilodontini has an unstable position and causes long-branch attraction, but this it is not the focus in this study, so we excluded this tribe in the analyses. Constraint on Machairodontinae was both performed in MrBayes.

Our matrix is adopted from Jiangzuo *et al.*[7], adding the new species and two corresponding traits: the antero-posterior width of the glenoid fossa, and shortening of the zygomatic arch (in red in electronic supplementary material, appendix).

For analyses of the evolutionary rate of different characters, we subdivided 71 traits into three categories: (i) general traits, including traits 9–45, 48, 57, 59–63, 65–67 and 70; (ii) traits correlated with open environments, including traits 50–54 and 58; (iii) traits correlated with killing behaviour, mainly those describing incisor size and canine morphology, and some key craniomandibular traits (e.g. length of the zygomatic arch, size of the mastoid process and size of the coronoid process), including traits 1–8, 46–47, 49, 55–56, 64, 68–69 and 71. The analyses were based on the tip-dating tree.

For biogeographic analyses, we tested different models using the methods proposed in BiogeoBEARS [74] implemented in the software RASP 4.2 [75,76]. The detailed setting of geographical information is provided in the electronic supplementary material, appendix. The best-fit model was chosen by weighted AICc. The diversity, dispersal and vicariance lines of Machairodontini are drawn through time from 12 Ma to present. The ancestral state was reconstructed using Bayestraits implemented in the software RASP 4.2 [75,76].

9

(d) Fossil locality

Houshan is a classical fossil site within the Linxia Basin, belonging to the Dashengou Fauna, best known for producing hundreds of skulls of Hezhengia [77]. Very abundant mammalian remains have been found from this fauna (see details in [23]). The huge hyaenid Dinocrocuta gigantea is the most abundant carnivore. The machairodont in this fauna was previously determined as Machairodus palanderi [23], and a juvenile mandible was recently determined as Machairodus aphanistus [78]. Other carnivores known include two medium-sized Agriotheriini bears, three mustelids (Promeles sp., Martes sp. and Pekania sp.), two skunks (Promephitis parvus and Promephitis hootoni), one barbourofelid (Albanosmilus sp.) and four hyaenids, the latter being Hyaenictitherium sp. (smaller than typical H. wongii), Ictitherium cf. viverrinum, Adcrocuta eximia and a new small form with a short rostrum. An age estimate of 8.7-9.8 Ma is proposed for the fauna [23].

Data accessibility. Data used in this study can be found in electronic supplementary material, appendix [79].

Authors' contributions. Q.J.: conceptualization, data curation, formal analysis, funding acquisition, investigation, methodology, software, validation, writing—original draft and writing—review and editing; L.W.: conceptualization, data curation, supervision and writing—

review and editing; O.S.: data curation, formal analysis, methodology, software and writing—original draft; R.Y.: data curation, project administration, resources and writing—original draft; J.F.: formal analysis and software; S.L.: visualization and writing—original draft; S.W.: funding acquisition, project administration, supervision and writing—review and editing; T.D.: funding acquisition, project administration, supervision and writing—review and editing.

All authors gave final approval for publication and agreed to be held accountable for the work performed therein.

Conflict of interests declaration. We declare we have no competing interests. Funding. This work was supported by the Strategic Priority Research Program of Chinese Academy of Sciences (grant no. XDA20070203 and XDB26000000), National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant nos. 42102001, 41872001, 41872005 and 41772018), Key Frontier Science Research Program of the Chinese Academy of Sciences (grant nos. QYZDY-SSW-DQC-22 and GJHZ1885) and China Scholarship Council, and the Frick Fund, Department of Vertebrate Paleontology, Division of Paleontology, AMNH.

Acknowledgements. We thank Second Comprehensive Scientific Expedition on the Tibetan Plateau for supporting the financial and logistical support in the field work. We thank Dr C. Zhang for help with Bayes Trait evolutionary rate analyses in MrBayes. For their help in accessing collections, we thank M. Surovy, E. Hoeger, S. Ketelsen, N. Duncan and N. Simmons (AMNH modern mammal collections), D. Lunde and J. J. Ososky (USNM modern mammal collections), M. Omura (MCZ modern mammal collections), X. Zhu and Y. Yang (IOZ modern mammal collections), and Z. Qiu, J. Chen, S. Chen and L. Zhang (fossil collections of the IVPP and HMV).

References

- Barnett R *et al.* 2020 Genomic adaptations and evolutionary history of the extinct scimitar-toothed cat, *Homotherium latidens. Curr. Biol.* **30**, 5018–5025. (doi:10.1016/j.cub.2020.09.051)
- Turner A, Antón M. 1997 The big cats and their fossil relatives: an illustrated guide to their evolution and natural history. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Antón M, Galobart À. 1999 Neck function and predatory behavior in the scimitar toothed cat *Homotherium latidens* (Owen). *J. Vertebr. Paleontol.* 19, 771–784.
- Antón M, Galobart A, Turner A. 2005 Co-existence of scimitar-toothed cats, lions and hominins in the European Pleistocene: implications of the post-cranial anatomy of *Homotherium latidens* (Owen) for comparative palaeoecology. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 24, 1287–1301.
- Antón M, Salesa MJ, Turner A, Galobart Á, Pastor JF. 2009 Soft tissue reconstruction of *Homotherium latidens* (Mammalia, Carnivora, Felidae): implications for the possibility of representations in Palaeolithic art. *Geobios* 42, 541–551.
- DeSantis LRG, Feranec RS, Anton M, Lundelius Jr EL. 2021 Dietary ecology of the scimitar-toothed cat *Homotherium serum. Curr. Biol.* **31**, 2674–2681. (doi:10.1016/j.cub.2021.03.061)
- Jiangzuo Q, Werdelin L, Sun Y. 2022 A dwarf sabertooth cat (Felidae: Machairodontinae) from Shanxi, China, and the phylogeny of the sabertooth tribe Machairodontini. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 284, 1–19. (doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2022.107517)
- 8. Antón M. 2013 *Sabertooth*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

- Werdelin L, Yamaguchi N, Johnson WE, O'Brien SJ. 2010 Phylogeny and evolution of cats (Felidae). In *Biology and conservation of wild felids* (eds DW Macdonald, AJ Loveridge), pp. 59–82. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Melentis JK. 1968 Studien uber fossile Vertebraten Griechenlands. 19. Die Pikermifauna von Halmyropotamos (Euboa-Griechenland). 1. Teil: Odontologie und Kraniologie. *Ann. Geologiques des Pays Helleniques* 19, 285–411.
- Antón M, Salesa MJ, Morales J, Turner A. 2004 First known complete skulls of the scimitar-toothed cat *Machairodus aphanistus* (Felidae, Carnivora) from the Spanish late Miocene site of Batallones-1. *J. Vertebr. Paleontol.* 24, 957–969.
- Geraads D, Spassov N. 2020 A skull of Machairodus Kaup, 1833 (Felidae, Mammalia) from the late Miocene of Hadjidimovo (Bulgaria), and its place in the evolution of the genus. *Geodiversitas* 42, 123–137.
- Geraads D, Kaya T, Tuna V. 2004 A skull of Machairodus giganteus (Felidae, Mammalia) from the Late Miocene of Turkey. Neues Jahrbuch fur Geol. und Palaontol. Monatshefte 2, 95–110.
- Sotnikova M. 1991 A new species of *Machairodus* from the late Miocene Kalmakpai locality in eastern Kazakhstan (USSR). *Ann. Zool. Fennici* 28, 361–369.
- Zdansky 0. 1924 Jungtertiäre Carnivoren Chinas. Palaeontologia Sinica, ser. C 2, 1–149.
- Deng T, Zhang YX, Tseng ZJ, Hou SK. 2016 A skull of Machairodus horribilis and new evidence for gigantism as a mode of mosaic evolution in machairodonts (Felidae, Carnivora). Vertebr. PalAsiatica 54, 302–318.

- Qiu ZX, Shi QQ, Liu JY. 2008 Description of skull material of Machairodus horribilis Schlosser, 1903. *Vertebr. PalAsiatica* 46, 265–283.
- 18. Qi G. 1983 Description of Carnivora fossils from Lufeng. *Acta Anthropol. Sin.* **2**, 11–20.
- Jiangzuo Q, Li S, Fu J, Wang S, Ji X, Duan M, Che D. 2022 Fossil Felidae (Carnivora: Mammalia) from the Yuanmou hominid site, southern China (Late Miocene) and its significance in the living environment of the fossil ape. *Zool. J. Linn. Soc.* **196**, 1156–1174. (doi:10.1093/zoolinnean/zlab116)
- Antón M, Salesa MJ, Siliceo G. 2013 Machairodont adaptations and affinities of the Holarctic late Miocene homotherin *Machairodus* (Mammalia, Carnivora, Felidae): the case of *Machairodus catocopis* Cope, 1887. *J. Vertebr. Paleontol.* 33, 1202–1213. (doi:10.1080/02724634.2013.760468)
- Ruiz-Ramoni D, Rincón AD, Montellano-Ballesteros M.
 2019 Taxonomic revision of a Machairodontinae (Felidae) from the Late Hemphillian of México. *Hist. Biol.* 32, 1312–1319. (doi:10.1080/08912963.2019.1583750)
- Jiangzuo Q, Hulbert RC. 2021 Coexistence of Indarctos and Amphimachairodus (Carnivora) in the Late Early Hemphillian of Florida, North America. J. Mammal. Evol. 28, 707–728. (doi:10.1007/ s10914-021-09546-9)
- 23. Deng T, Qiu ZX, Wang BY, Wang XM, Hou SK. 2013 Late Cenozoic Biostratigraphy of the Linxia Basin, Northwestern China. In *Fossil mammals of Asia* (eds X Wang, ∐ Flynn, M Fortelius), pp. 243–273. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- 24. Kaakinen ANU, Passey BH, Zhang ZQ, Liu LP, Pesonen LJ, Fortelius M. 2013 Stratigraphy and paleoecology

royalsocietypublishing.org/journal/rspb Proc. R. Soc. B 290: 20230019

10

of the classical dragon bone localities of baode county, Shanxi Province. In *Fossil mammals of Asia* (eds X Wang, LJ Flynn, M Fortelius), pp. 203–217. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.

- Dalquest WW. 1969 Pliocene carnivores of the coffee ranch (Type Hemphill) local fauna. *Bullet. Texas Mem. Mus.* 15, 1–44.
- Jiangzuo Q, Wang S, Deng T. 2023 Chronological framework and palaeoecology of Carnivora from the Linxia Basin, China. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 615, 111463. (doi:10.1016/j.palaeo. 2023.111463)
- Cerling TE, Wang Y, Quade J. 1993 Expansion of C4 ecosystems as an indicator of global ecological change in the late Miocene. *Nature* 361, 344–345.
- Ma Y, Wu F, Fang X, Li J, An Z, Wang W. 2005 Pollen record from red clay sequence in the central Loess Plateau between 8.10 and 2.60 Ma. *Chin. Sci. Bull.* 50, 2234–2243. (doi:10.1007/bf03182675)
- Popescu SM. 2006 Late Miocene and early Pliocene environments in the southwestern Black Sea region from high-resolution palynology of DSDP Site 380A (Leg 42B). *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 238, 64–77. (doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2006.03.018)
- Koufos GD, Vasileiadou K. 2015 Miocene/Pliocene mammal faunas of southern Balkans: implications for biostratigraphy and palaeoecology. *Palaeobiodivers. Palaeoenviron.* 95, 285–303. (doi:10.1007/s12549-015-0201-4)
- Ao H, Roberts AP, Dekkers MJ, Liu X, Rohling EJ, Shi Z, An Z, Zhao X. 2016 Late Miocene–Pliocene Asian monsoon intensification linked to Antarctic ice-sheet growth. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 444, 75–87. (doi:10. 1016/j.epsl.2016.03.028)
- Ao H *et al.* 2021 Global warming-induced Asian hydrological climate transition across the Miocene-Pliocene boundary. *Nat. Commun.* 12, 6935. (doi:10. 1038/s41467-021-27054-5)
- Werdelin L, Sardella R. 2006 The *Homotherium* from Langebaanweg, South Africa and the origin of *Homotherium*. *Palaeontograp*. *Abteilung A* 277, 123–130.
- Werdelin L, Peigné S. 2010 Carnivora. In *Cenozoic mammals of Africa* (eds L Werdelin, WJ Sanders), pp. 609–664. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.
- Salles LO. 1992 Felid phylogenetics: extant taxa and skull morphology (Felidae, Aeluroidea). *Am. Mus. Novitates* **3047**, 1–67.
- Reznik GK. 1990 Comparative anatomy, physiology, and function of the upper respiratory tract. *Environ. Health Perspect.* 85, 171–176. (doi:10.1289/ehp.85-1568330)
- Sunquist M, Sunquist F. 2002 Wild cats of the world. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Monescillo MF, Salesa MJ, Antón M, Siliceo G, Morales J. 2014 *Machairodus aphanistus* (Felidae, Machairodontinae, Homotherini) from the late Miocene (Vallesian, MN 10) site of Batallones-3 (Torrejon de Velasco, Madrid, Spain). *J. Vertebr. Paleontol.* 34, 699–709.
- Martin L, Babiarz J, Naples V, Hearst J. 2000 Three ways to be a saber-toothed cat. *Naturwissenschaften* 87, 41–44.

- Antón M, Siliceo G, Pastor JF, Morales J, Salesa MJ. 2020 The early evolution of the sabre-toothed felid killing bite: the significance of the cervical morphology of *Machairodus aphanistus* (Carnivora: Felidae: Machairodontinae). *Zool. J. Linn. Soc.* 188, 319–342. (doi:10.1093/zoolinnean/zlz086)
- Antón M, Salesa MJ, Pastor JF, SÁNchez IM, Fraile S, Morales J. 2004 Implications of the mastoid anatomy of larger extant felids for the evolution and predatory behaviour of sabretoothed cats (Mammalia, Carnivora, Felidae). *Zool. J. Linn. Soc.* 140, 207–221. (doi:10.1111/j.1096-3642.2003. 00093.x)
- Miao Y *et al.* 2022 A new biologic paleoaltimetry indicating Late Miocene rapid uplift of northern Tibet Plateau. *Science* **378**, 1074–1079. (doi:10. 1126/science.abo2475)
- Deng T, Hou SK, Xie GP, W SQ, Shi QQ, Chen SK, Sun BY, Lu XK. 2013 Chronostratigraphic subdivision and correlation of the Upper Miocene of the Linxia Basin in Gansu, China. J. Stratigrap. 37, 417–427.
- Sun B, Liu Y, Chen S, Deng T. 2022 *Hippotherium* Datum implies Miocene palaeoecological pattern. *Sci. Rep.* 12, 3605. (doi:10.1038/s41598-022-07639-w)
- Agusti J, Moya-Sola S. 1990 Mammal extinctions in the Vallesian (Upper Miocene). In *Extinction events* in earth history, proceedings of the project 216, global biological events in earth. Lecture notes in earth sciences (eds EG Kauffman, OH Walliser), pp. 425–432. Berlin, Germany: Springer.
- The NOW Community. 2017 New and Old Worlds database of fossil mammals (NOW). See http:// www.helsinki.fi/science/now.
- Solounias N, Semprebon GM, Mihlbachler MC, Rivals F. 2013 Paleodietary comparisons of ungulates between the Late Miocene of China, and Pikermi and Samos in Greece. In *Fossil mammals of Asia* (eds X Wang, LJ Flynn, M Fortelius), pp. 676–692. New York, NY: Columbia University Press.
- Solounias N, Rivals F, Semprebon GM. 2010 Dietary interpretation and paleoecology of herbivores from Pikermi and Samos (late Miocene of Greece). *Paleobiology* 36, 113–136. (doi:10.1666/0094-8373-36.1.113)
- Merceron G, Blondel C, Viriot L, Koufos GD, Bonis LD. 2007 Dental microwear analysis of bovids from the Vallesian (late Miocene) of Axios Valley in Greece reconstruction of the habitat of Ouranopithecus macedoniensis (Primates, Hominoidea). *Geodiversitas* 29, 421–433.
- Agustí J, Cabrera L, Garcés M. 2013 The Vallesian Mammal Turnover: a Late Miocene record of decoupled land-ocean evolution. *Geobios* 46, 151–157. (doi:10.1016/j.geobios.2012.10.005)
- Casanovas-Vilar I, Moyá-Solá S, Agustí J, Köhler M. 2005 The geography of a faunal turnover: tracking the Vallesian Crisis. In *Migration of organisms* (ed. AMT Elewa), pp. 247–300. Heidelberg, Germany: Springer.
- Liu T, Li CK, Zhai RJ. 1978 Pliocene vertebrate of Lantian, Shensi: tertiary mammalian fauna of the Lantian District, Shensi. *Prof. Papers Stratigr. Palaeontol.* 7, 149–200.

- 53. Mulch A, Chamberlain CP. 2006 The rise and growth of Tibet. *Nature* **439**, 670–671.
- Deng T, Ding L. 2015 Paleo-altimetry reconstructions of the Tibetan Plateau: progress and contradictions. *Natl Sci. Rev.* 93, 92–95.
- 55. Packer C, Ruttan L. 1988 The evolution of cooperative hunting. *Am. Nat.* **132**, 159–198.
- Stander PE. 1992 Cooperative hunting in lions: the role of the individual. *Behav. Ecol. Sociobiol.* 29, 445–454.
- Qiu ZX, Xie J, Yan D. 1988 Discovery of the skull of Dinocrocuta gigantea. Vertebr. Palasiatica 26, 128–138.
- Deng T. 2009 Late Cenozoic environmental changes in the Linxia Basin (Gansu, China) as indicated by cenograms of fossil mammals. *Vertebr. PalAsiatica* 47, 40–56.
- Zhang YX, Xue XX. 1996 New materials of Dinocrocuta gigantea found from Fugu Conuty, Shaanxi Province. Vertebr. Palasiatica 34, 18–25.
- Palomares F, Caro T. 1999 Interspecific killing among mammalian carnivores. *Am. Nat.* 153, 492–508.
- Crusafont Pairó M, Kurtén B. 1976 Bears and beardogs from the Vallesian of the Vallés-Penedés basin, Spain. Acta Zool. Fennica 144, 1–30.
- 62. Morales J, Abella J, Valenciano A. 2017 Thaumastocyon: los extraños Amphicyonidae de Batallones. In La colina de los Tigres Dientes de Sable: los yacimientos miocenos del Cerro de los Batallones (Torrejón de Velasco, Comunidad de Madrid) (ed. J Morales), pp. 339–351. Madrid, Spain: Museo Arqueológico Regional, Comunidad de Madrid.
- Abella J, Valenciano A. 2017 Indarctos arctoides: Los ancestros de los grandes osos Panda. In La colina de los Tigres Dientes de Sable: los yacimientos miocenos del Cerro de los Batallones (Torrejón de Velasco, Comunidad de Madrid) (ed. V Autores), pp. 303–316. Madrid, Spain: Obra Social La Caixa.
- Peigné S, Salesa MJ, Anton M, Morales J. 2008 A new Amphicyonine (Carnivora: Amphicyonidae) from the Upper Miocene of Batallones1, Madrid, Spain. *Palaeontology* 51, 943–965.
- Gittleman JL. 1989 Carnivore group living: comparative trends. In *Carnivore behavior, ecology, and evolution* (eds JL Gittleman), pp. 183–207. Boston, MA: Springer.
- 66. Palmqvist P, Martínez-Navarro B, Pérez-Claros JA, Torregrosa V, Figueirido B, Jiménez-Arenas JM, Espigares MP, Ros-Montoya S, De Renzi M. 2011 The giant hyena *Pachycrocuta brevirostris*: modelling the bone-cracking behavior of an extinct carnivore. *Quat. Int.* **243**, 61–79.
- Qiu ZX, Deng T, Wang BY. 2014 A Late Miocene Ursavus skull from Guanghe, Gansu, China. Vertebr. PalAsiatica 52, 265–302.
- Jiangzuo Q, Liu J. 2020 First record of the Eurasian jaguar in southern Asia and a review of dental differences between pantherine cats. *J. Quaternary Sci.* 35, 817–830.
- 69. Wickham H. 2016 *Ggplot2: elegant graphics for data analysis*. New York, NY: Springer.
- R Development Core Team. 2016 *R: a language and environment for statistical computing*. Vienna, Austria: R Foundation for Statistical Computing.

- Huelsenbeck JP, Ronquist F. 2001 MRBAYES: Bayesian inference of phylogenetic trees. *Bioinformatics* 17, 754–755. (doi:10.1093/ bioinformatics/17.8.754)
- Ronquist F et al. 2012 MrBayes 3.2: efficient Bayesian phylogenetic inference and model choice across a large model space. Syst. Biol. 61, 539–542. (doi:10.1093/sysbio/sys029)
- Ronquist F, Klopfstein S, Vilhelmsen L, Schulmeister S, Murray DL, Rasnitsyn AP. 2012 A total-evidence approach to dating with fossils, applied to the early radiation of the hymenoptera. *Syst. Biol.* 61, 973–999. (doi:10.1093/sysbio/sys058)
- 74. Matzke NJ. 2013 BioGeoBEARS: BioGeography with Bayesian (and likelihood) evolutionary analysis in R

Scripts. R package, version 0.2 1. See https://github. com/nmatzke/BioGeoBEARS.

- Yu Y, Blair C, He X. 2019 RASP 4: ancestral state reconstruction tool for multiple genes and characters. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **37**, 604–606. (doi:10.1093/molbev/msz257)
- Yu Y, Harris AJ, Blair C, He X. 2015 RASP (Reconstruct Ancestral State in Phylogenies): a tool for historical biogeography. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 87, 46–49. (doi:10.1016/j.ympev.2015. 03.008)
- 77. Shi Q, Deng T. 2021 Redescription of the skull of *Hezhengia bohlini* (Artiodactyla, Mammalia) and a reassessment of the systematics of the Chinese late Miocene 'ovibovines'. J. Syst.

Paleontol. **18**, 2059–2074. (doi:10.1080/14772019. 2021.1883756)

- Li Y, Xiong W, Wang L, He W, Sun B. 2021 First record of *Machairodus aphanistus* KAUP, 1833 (Carnivora, Felidae, Machairodontinae) in East Asia from a late Miocene deposit of the Linxia Basin, Gansu Province, China. *Hist. Biol.* 34, 930–939. (doi:10.1080/08912963.2021. 1952574)
- 79. Jiangzuo Q, Werdelin L, Sanisidro O, Yang R, Fu J, Li S, Wang S, Deng T. 2023 Origin of adaptations to open environments and social behaviour in sabretoothed cats from the northeastern border of the Tibetan Plateau. Figshare. (doi:10.6084/m9. figshare.c.6501234)